

Perspective: The Gilbert-O Debate

The recent decision by USM to hire Faye Gilbert, currently the b-school dean at Radford University, to replace former CoB dean Lance Nail, now dean at Texas Tech University, is drawing at least some backlash in the USM community. One of the primary criticisms at this point is that Gilbert’s hiring represents yet another example of so-called “inbreeding” at USM. In this case, Gilbert earned two degrees from USM in the 1980s, both before earning a doctorate in 2008 from the University of North Texas. This and other criticisms are the subject of recent reports and editorials/letters here at USMNEWS.net.

This particular report addresses other facets of the Gilbert hire, namely her being the first female CoB dean and her qualifications for the job, particularly vis-à-vis other female b-school deans in Mississippi. These facets were emphasized by Gilbert herself, when she stated (for a 6-March-2013 [news report](#)) to Ed Kemp, the higher education reporter for *The Hattiesburg American*: “I’m proud to be first women [sic] dean. I’m prouder to be qualified for the job.” Perhaps little known among even regular USMNEWS.net readers is the fact that Mississippi State University recently hired a female to serve as dean of its b-school. That individual, Sharon Oswald (also referred to as “Dean O” in this report), was awarded an annual salary of \$250,000, quite similar to the \$233,300 per year salary offered by USM to Gilbert in recent days, even though the b-school leadership position at MSU is accompanied by many more, and greater, administrative responsibilities and concerns than that at USM.

Given these similar salaries, reporters investigated the research record of both individuals. This report begins with Gilbert, as shown in Table 1 below.

Table 1: Dean Gilbert’s Research

Year	Faye Gilbert	Notes
2012	Journal of Promotion Management	3 rd of 3 authors [B-Gr-G]
2011		
2010		
2009		
2008		
2007		
2006	Journal of Business Ethics	4 th of 4 authors [S-V-R-G]
	Journal of Marketing Channels	2 nd of 3 authors [M-G-Y]
2005	Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science	4 th of 4 authors [V-R-B-G]
2004		
2003	Advances in Consumer Research	3 rd of 3 authors [V-R-G]
2002	Journal of Marketing Theory & Practice	2 nd of 2 authors [B-G]
	Journal of Retailing	3 rd of 4 authors [T-V-G-R]
2001	Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science	3 rd of 4 authors [B-R-G-I]
2000		
1999	Journal of Applied Business Research	2 nd of 2 authors [M-G]
1998		
1997	Journal of Business Research	3 rd of 4 authors [N-V-G-B]
1996	Journal of Business Research	2 nd of 3 authors [Y-G-M]
	Journal of Marketing Education	1 st of 2 authors [G-P]
	Journal of Marketing Management	2 nd of 3 authors [Y-G-M]
1995	Psychology & Marketing	1 st of 2 authors [G-W]
1994	Journal of Applied Business Research	1 st of 2 authors [G-T]
	Journal of Business Research	1 st of 3 authors [G-Y-O]
	Journal of Marketing Theory & Practice	3 rd of 3 authors [Y-Ga-G]
	Marketing Education Review	2 nd of 2 authors [M-G]
1993	Journal of Marketing Management	2 nd of 2 authors [W-G]

1992	Journal of Health Care Marketing	1 st of 3 authors [G-L-D]
	Journal of Marketing Education	1 st of 3 authors [G-P-I]
1991		
1990		
1989		
1988		

As Table 1 shows, Gilbert's record includes **21** journal publications with **61** total authors. This record, therefore, consists of **2.90** authors per paper. Gilbert is, on average, the **2.19th** author across these 21 journal publications. Also across these 21 journal publications Gilbert has teamed with **40** co-authors (including repeats). On only **4** occasions (**10.0%**) is Gilbert listed ahead of someone whose last name begins with letters appearing earlier in the alphabet than Gilbert's last name. At the same time, there are **20** occasions (**50.0%**) where Gilbert is listed behind someone whose last name begins with letters appearing later in the alphabet than Gilbert's last name. The remaining **16** occasions (**40.0%**) represent alphabetical ordering.

Oswald's numbers are in stark contrast to those of Gilbert, as shown in Table 2 below.

Table 2: Dean O's Research

Year	Dean O	Notes
2012	Entrepreneurship & Regional Development	2 nd of 4 authors [T- O -S-A]
2011	Journal of Applied Business Research	3 rd of 3 authors [S-W- O]
2010		
2009	Business Renaissance Quarterly	2 nd of 2 authors [I- O]
	Journal of Small Business Management	1 st of 3 authors [O -M-R]
2008		
2007	Journal of Information Technology	2 nd of 3 authors [M- O -M]
2006	Decision Sciences Journal of Innovative Education	3 rd of 4 authors [S-C- O -R]
	Family Business Review	3 rd of 3 authors [R-M- O]
	Journal of Services Marketing	3 rd of 3 authors [S-T- O]
2005	International Journal of Entrepreneurship & Innovation Management	1 st of 3 authors [O -W-B]
	Journal of Business and Economic Studies	3 rd of 3 authors [P-J- O]
	Journal of Business Research	2 nd of 4 authors [S- O -L-A]
	Journal of Nonprofit & Public Sector Marketing	2 nd of 2 authors [W- O]
	Journal of Small Business Management	3 rd of 4 authors [G-R- O -G]
	Small Business Economics	3 rd of 4 authors [M-R- O -R]
2004		
2003		
2002		
2001	Journal of Business and Economic Studies	3 rd of 3 authors [R-M- O]
2000	Administration & Society	Solo
	Managerial and Decision Economics	3 rd of 3 authors [P- O -J]
	New England Journal of Entrepreneurship	2 nd of 2 authors [R- O]
1999	Journal of Economics and Finance	3 rd of 3 authors [P-J- O]
	Journal of Services Marketing	2 nd of 2 authors [H- O]
1998	Employee Responsibilities and Rights Journal	2 nd of 3 authors [S- O -C]
	Marketing Health Services	1 st of 4 authors [O -T-S-B]
1997	Group & Organization Management	1 st of 3 authors [O -M-H]
	International Journal of Management	1 st of 3 authors [O -S-L]
1996	Applied Financial Economics	2 nd of 2 authors [G- O]
	Business Horizons	2 nd of 2 authors [S- O]
	Hospital and Health Services Administration	2 nd of 2 authors [G- O]
	Journal of Management in Medicine	3 rd of 3 authors [B- O -T]
1995	California Management Review	1 st of 2 authors [O -B]
	Journal of Management in Medicine	3 rd of 3 authors [S-Z- O]
1994	Strategic Management Journal	1 st of 3 authors [O -M-H]
	Managerial and Decision Economics	1 st of 3 authors [O -G-J]
1993	International Journal of Management	1 st of 3 authors [O -T-S]
	Journal of Labor Research	3 rd of 3 authors [S-S- O]
	Managerial and Decision Economics	2 nd of 2 authors [C- O]

1992	Industrial & Labor Relations Review	2 nd of 2 authors [C-0]
	International Journal of Healthcare Quality Assurance	1 st of 3 authors [0-H-W]
1991	Business Horizons	1 st of 2 authors [0-S]
	Industrial Relations	Solo
	Planning Review	2 nd of 4 authors [R-0-S-T]
	Strategic Management Journal	1 st of 2 authors [0-J]
1990	Labor Law Journal	2 nd of 2 authors [W-0]
1989		
1988	Personnel	2 nd of 3 authors [S-0-S]

As Table 2 shows, Dean O's record includes **43** journal publications with **118** total authors. This record, therefore, consists of **2.74** authors per paper. Dean O is, on average, the **1.98th** author across these 43 journal publications. Also across these 43 journal publications Dean O has teamed with **75** co-authors (including repeats). On **20** occasions (**26.7%**) Oswald listed ahead of someone whose last name begins with letters appearing earlier in the alphabet than Oswald's last name. At the same time, there are **25** occasions (**33.3%**) where Oswald is listed behind someone whose last name begins with letters appearing later in the alphabet than Oswald's last name. The remaining **30** occasions (**40.0%**) represent alphabetical ordering.

Table 3: Debate Summary

	Dean Gilbert	Dean O
Journal Publications	21	43
Authors/Publication	2.90	2.74
Author Placement Avg	2.19 th	1.98 th
% Placed Ahead	10.0	26.7
% Placed Behind	50.0	33.3
# Solo Pubs	0	2

As the debate summary above shows, Dean O wins every point against Dean Gilbert, including solo journal publications. As sources add, this type of comparison calls for a salary gap between the two that is much larger than the one (\$17,000) that currently exists. Put differently, if MSU could secure Dean O's services for \$250,000, then USM should have been able to do better than Gilbert with \$233,300.